



MTO 26.3 Examples: Goldenberg, Continuous Question-Answer Pairs

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)

<https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.20.26.3/mto.20.26.3.goldenberg.html>

Example 1. Beethoven, Minuet in E-flat major, WoO 82, mm. 1–8

question; compound basic idea; possibly statement in a presentation of a compound sentence

basic idea contrasting idea

Moderato $\hat{5}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$

$ii \begin{smallmatrix} 6 \\ 5 \end{smallmatrix}$ Laitz: not a cadence, just a caesura

answer (symmetrical and parallel); consequent of a compound basic idea; possibly response in a presentation of a compound sentence

basic idea contrasting idea

$\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$

v^7 I (IAC)

Example 2. Beethoven, Minuet in E-flat major, WoO 82, mm. 27–34

question; compound basic idea; half of an independent hyper-unit

Moderato

basic idea contrasting idea

27 $\hat{5}$ $\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$

ii $\begin{smallmatrix} 6 \\ 5 \end{smallmatrix}$

Laitz: not a cadence,
just a caesura

answer (symmetrical and parallel); consequent of c.b.i.; half of an independent hyper-unit, completes melodic motion

basic idea contrasting idea

31 $\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$ $\hat{1}$

V $\begin{smallmatrix} 7 \end{smallmatrix}$

I (PAC)

Example 3. Mozart, Symphony no. 39 in E-flat major, K. 543, third movement, mm. 1–8

question; Harrison: antecedent

I IV

Laitz: no cadence,
just a caesura
Harrison: plagal HC

answer (symmetrical, parallel); Harrison: consequent

4

V I (IAC)

Example 4. Haydn, *The Seven Last Words of Christ*, orchestral version, Hob. XX:1, second movement, final measures

Grave e cantabile

larger QAP: larger question answer (melodic and harmonic parallelism)

surface QAP: rhythmic parallelism alone divides each phrase into sub-units

question answer

vn. I
[col fl.
8va higher] *p*

expanded cadential progression deceptive cadence expanded cadential progression repeated PAC

Example 5. Dvořák, Piano Quintet in A major, op. 81, third movement, mm. 9–16, piano part

question

answer (symmetrical, parallel)

basic idea

opening motive

opening motive

rhythmic repeat of basic idea

transposed opening motive

Molto vivace

mf

f

I V⁶ vi III[#] (V/vi) ii cad. $\frac{6}{4}$ V I

caesura,
no cadence

Example 6. Dvořák, Piano Quintet in A major, op. 81, third movement, mm. 31–38, piano part

question

answer (symmetrical, parallel)

basic idea

opening motive

opening motive

rhythmic repeat of basic idea

reharmonized opening motive

upper-voice caesura,
no cadence

Molto vivace

p

cresc.

f

in iii: i V i

continuous chromatically filled descending tetrachord (lament bass in fast tempo)

Example 7. Haydn, String Quartet in B minor, op. 33, no. 1, third movement, mm. 41–44
(immediately after the double bar)

question; compound basic idea;
potentially, statement of sentence presentation

continuous answer (symmetrical, parallel);
consequent of compound basic idea;
potentially, response of sentence presentation

Andante

p

fz

3 4

4 3 2 1

i V⁴₃ 6 5 i

Example 8. Mozart, Piano Sonata in C minor, K. 457, first movement, mm. 1–8

question; compound basic idea

basic idea

contrasting idea

f

p

5 6

i vii^o 6 5

continuous answer (symmetrical, parallel); consequent (of compound basic idea)

basic idea

contrasting idea

5

(or: back to G since m. 5)

f

p

5 6

V vii^o 6 5 i 6 3

1 in inner voice

Example 9. Beethoven, Piano Sonata in B-flat major, op. 22, third movement, mm. 1–8

antecedent

m: ascending 3rd

n: gruppetto + leaping descending app.

n1

o: ascending fifth

ascending stepwise app.

p

p

p

p

I

V potential HC

continuous contrasting (? includes motives from antecedent) consequent (Caplin: continuation, not consequent)

n reinterpreted as ascending 3rd [m]

n

n1

n1 o n1

descending stepwise app.

ln *p*

cresc.

ln *p*

ln *p*

ln *p*

p

V continues HC deleted

I

Example 10a. Beethoven, Serenade for String Trio in D major, op. 8, fourth movement, mm. 1–8
(after Caplin 1998, 52, Example 4.8)

Scherzo. Allegro molto.

antecedent: tonic version

consequent: dominant version

p

p

sempre staccato

f

I ii⁶₅ # (V) V⁸ HC (V:PAC) 7 I ii⁶₅ V I *f* PAC

Example 10b. Two voice-leading graphs of the Serenade for String Trio in D major, op. 8, fourth movement, mm. 1–8

1. Reading as a single harmonic progression

question (antecedent) answer (dominant-version consequent creating a single structural harmonic progression)

I ii $\frac{6}{5}$ (V) V $\frac{8}{7}$ I ii $\frac{6}{5}$ V I

HC
(V:PAC)

2. Reading as misaligned interrupted period

question (antecedent) answer (dominant beginning of consequent as surface delay of post-interruption tonic)

I ii $\frac{6}{5}$ (V) V $\frac{8}{7}$ I ii $\frac{6}{5}$ V I

HC
(V:PAC)

Example 11. Mozart, Piano Sonata in D major, K. 576, first movement, mm. 1–8

Allegro

antecedent

basic idea

contrasting idea

f

tr

I

HC

sequential consequent

basic idea (sequential)

new contrasting idea

ii

V

PAC

Example 12. Three interpretations of periods of the I–V, ii–V–I type

a) antecedent consequent

b) antecedent consequent

c) antecedent consequent

back-relating V

auxiliary cadence

I V I

I ii V I

I V I

Example 13. Schubert, Piano Trio no. 1 in B-flat major, D. 898, first movement, mm. 1–12

The image displays two musical staves, labeled 'I' and 'ii', representing different parts of a composition. The top staff, 'I', is marked 'Allegro moderato' and features a complex melodic line with triplets and a 'question' section. The bottom staff, 'ii', is marked 'sequential consequent' and features a more rhythmic, triplet-based melody. Both staves include a bass line with a steady eighth-note accompaniment. The notation includes various musical symbols such as notes, rests, triplets, and dynamic markings like 'f' (forte).

Example 14. Haydn, Symphony no. 21 in A major, third movement, mm. 1–8

antecedent

f

I V⁷ I HC caesura

continuous consequent as misaligned consequent of an interrupted period

dislocated motive

p

V⁷ I V⁷ PAC

Example 15. Schubert, Minuet in A major, D. 91, no. 2, mm. 1–8

question

f *ff* *dolce*

I vi IV caesura, no cadence

answer (symmetrical, **contrasting** except motivic upbeat)

V (I) V⁷ PAC

motive from question

Example 16. Schumann, *Davidsbündlertänze*, op. 6, no. 16, mm. 1–8

Mit gutem Humor

question

p

I

V 4 of ii

6 5 4 3

no rhythmic caesura;
dynamic mark
of link

continuous answer (symmetrical, parallel, sequential, modulatory)

f *p*

ii

#

V

V: PAC

Example 17. Mozart, Piano Concerto in B-flat major, K. 450, first movement, mm. 1–8

question with clear divided internal organization

continuous answer (symmetrical, parallel), completing a descending third progression

Example 18. Dvořák, Piano Quintet in A major, op. 81, third movement, mm. 60–67

mp open unit (ascending to active tonic member) closed unit (descending to tonic tone)

I

Example 19. Chopin, Mazurka in C minor, op. 56, no. 3, mm. 81–88

question

81 *f* $\hat{3}$ $\hat{2}$ I V

continuous answer (symmetrical, parallel) completing a descending third-progression to $\hat{1}$

85 $\hat{2}$ $\hat{1}$ *v (=V_b)* I

Example 20. Haydn, String Quartet in B minor, op. 33, no. 1, third movement, mm. 1–8

8-measure (or 16-measure, $R=1/2N$?) sentence

presentation serves also as 4-measure (or 8-measure, $R=1/2N$?) continuous period (or similar hybrid)

statement antecedent continuous response
continuous consequent

Andante

I V7 (weakened HC, 7th in inner voice) I

continuation by means of fragmentation leading to cadence

V7 HC

Example 21. Mozart, Fantasy in D minor, K. 397, mm. 12–15 (after Salzer 1962, Example 207)

Adagio

12

p

question (statement) LN UN continuous answer (response)

i V $\frac{4}{3}$ 6 5 i

Example 22. Mozart, Piano Concerto, K.453, third movement, mm. 1–8

first unit: question? antecedent of sectional period? ends with a IAC

Allegretto

p

3rd (initial ascent)

I IAC

second unit (symmetrical, parallel, continuous, modulatory):
answer (consequent) leading to a stronger cadence (V:PAC)? or less stable (HC?)

2

5th (descent into an inner voice)

V V: PAC

Example 23. Bizet, Habanera from *Carmen*, mm. 1–9

question; antecedent of interrupted period in melody only

upper voice only

ii[°]₄
(p.p.)

V⁷
over p.p.

i

Example 24. Grieg, "Illusion," from *Lyric Pieces*, op. 57, no. 3, mm. 1–8

Allegretto serio

p

Continuous 2-octave descent: E4 to E2

2nd becomes 9th divided into 4 3rds

int-fill modified

E3 to bass de-emphasized

[i] local V connects I and vi VI iv ii⁶₃ V

poco rit. *pp*

3rd becomes 10th (despite harmonic change?)

bass comes from inner voice pre-int. V continues

i⁶₃ VI⁶₃ iv⁶₃ V⁶₃ — 5 i

2 1