



A JOURNAL OF THE SOCIETY FOR MUSIC THEORY

**MTO 26.3 Examples: Marlowe, Resolving Tensions between
Outer Form and Inner Form in Fugue**

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)

<https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.20.26.3/mto.20.26.3.marlowe.html>

Example 1. Schenker's unpublished sketch of J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I) from the Oster Collection (File 71/10). High-resolution color images courtesy of the Music Division, The New York Public Library for the Performing Arts

Outline of
voice entries
in the Exposition

Handwritten musical sketch of the Exposition of J.S. Bach's Fugue in D minor, WTC I. The sketch shows the first three staves of the fugue. The first staff is the Soprano voice, the second is the Alto voice, and the third is the Bass voice. The sketch includes various annotations in blue and red ink, including 'dux' and 'comes' labels, and a large red circle around the first entry. The sketch is on aged, yellowed paper.

Outline of the entire
fugue, highlighting
two-part design

Handwritten musical sketch of the entire fugue, highlighting the two-part design. The sketch shows the first two staves of the fugue. The first staff is the Soprano voice, and the second is the Alto voice. The sketch includes various annotations in blue and red ink, including a large red circle around the first entry and a large blue circle around the second entry. The sketch is on aged, yellowed paper.

sprayed with
fixatif

Example 2. Schenker's middleground sketch of J. S. Bach Fugue in D minor (WTC I) from *Free Composition* ([1935] 1979, Fig. 156/1)

The image displays Schenker's middleground sketch of the first system of J. S. Bach's Fugue in D minor (WTC I). The sketch is presented in two systems of musical notation, each with a treble and bass staff. The top system covers measures 1 to 20, and the bottom system covers measures 21 to 43. Above the staves, Schenker's analytical symbols are used: 'I' for the main structural line, 'II' for a secondary line, and 'V' for a tertiary line. Roman numerals (I, II, III, IV, V, VI, VII, VIII, IX, X, XI, XII, XIII, XIV, XV, XVI, XVII, XVIII, XIX, XX) are placed above the measures to indicate the harmonic structure. Labels such as '(a)', '(s)', '(u)', and '(v)' are used to denote specific musical elements. The sketch is a middleground analysis, showing the underlying harmonic and melodic structure of the fugue.

Example 3. Franck's middleground sketch of J. S. Bach Fugue in D minor (WTC I)

a. "First Branch" (2010, 141)

The image displays two systems of musical notation for a piano piece, identified as 'First Branch' (2010, 141). The notation is in D minor, indicated by two flats in the key signature.

System 1 (Measures 1-15):

- Measures 1-5 are grouped by a bracket labeled 'S'.
- Measures 6-10 are grouped by a bracket labeled 'A'.
- Measures 11-15 are grouped by a bracket labeled 'S'.
- Measure 16 is marked with a fermata and the annotation '(to D5)'.
- Measure 17 is marked with a fermata and the annotation '(to F3)'.
- Measure 18 is marked with a fermata.
- Measures 19-21 are grouped by a bracket labeled 'S'.

System 2 (Measures 22-28):

- Measures 22-24 are grouped by a bracket labeled '4th-prg.'.
- Measures 25-27 are grouped by a bracket labeled 'S'.
- Measure 28 is marked with a fermata and the annotation '(to D5)'.

Annotations and Markings:

- 'i6' is written below measure 22.
- 'V#4' is written below measure 25.
- 'S (inv/alt.)' is written below measures 26-27.
- 'arp.' is written below measure 28.
- 'S' is written below measures 29-31.

Measure Numbers:

Measure numbers are indicated in circles: 1, 5, 10, 15, 21, and 28.

21 25 30

31 35 40 44

iv

Episode 4

4th-prg.

S (alt.)

S (inv.)

S (inv/alt.)

3rd-prg.

S (alt.)

S

N

arp.

S (inv/alt.)

S (alt.)

V

i

i⁶

V

i

(⁶/₄)

i

Example 4. Väisälä's middleground sketch of J. S. Bach Fugue in D minor (WTC I)

a. Sketch of entire fugue (2011, 48)

Rhyme

I $\longrightarrow$ V V $\longrightarrow$ I

b. Voice-leading reduction of mm. 21–39 (2011, 46)

Reduction

V⁵ — 6—6[#] / 4—4 / 3 (IV) V I

Example 5. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), subject and answer, mm. 1–6

subject

answer

CSx

CSy

Example 6. Analyses of the subject and answer from J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I)

a. Schenker ([1935] 1979, Fig. 53/5)

(subject)

(1st cpt.)

(rg.-ov.)

(answer)

8- (8- -8) -8

(V $\flat$ 3 - $\flat$ 3 7) I

d minor: = I

b. Proctor and Riggins (1988, 120)

harmonic reduction, mm. 1–6

voice-leading sketch, mm. 1–6

I

V

#

I

(3 - prg.)

c. Renwick (1995a, 70)

1 2 3 4 5 5 6 7 1 2

I IV V A-: I II6 V D-: II

5 4 3 2 1 1 V I

d. Väisälä (2011, 47; excerpt)

voice-leading sketch, mm. 1–6

IN IN 5 IN 1

I (IV) V 8-7 (II) -7 I

Example 7. J. S. Bach, Fugue in E major (*WTC I*), subject, mm. 1–5

a. Middleground sketch

b. Foreground sketch

E major: I ————— V

c. Score excerpt

1 2 3 4 5

subject

answer

10th pitch

14th pitch

22nd pitch

subject

E major: I ————— 4 6
2 V

Example 8. J. S. Bach, Fugue in E major (WTC I), mm. 5–8

a. Middleground framework

Diagram illustrating the middleground framework of the Fugue in E major, mm. 5–8. The score is in E major (three sharps) and common time. The framework is shown across four measures, labeled 5, 6, 7, and 8. The treble and bass staves are connected by dashed lines, indicating voice leading. The bass line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The treble line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The key signature is E major: V.

b. Foreground framework

Diagram illustrating the foreground framework of the Fugue in E major, mm. 5–8. The score is in E major (three sharps) and common time. The framework is shown across four measures, labeled 5, 6, 7, and 8. The treble and bass staves are connected by dashed lines, indicating voice leading. The bass line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The treble line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The key signature is E major: V.

c. Score excerpt

Diagram illustrating the score excerpt of the Fugue in E major, mm. 5–8. The score is in E major (three sharps) and common time. The excerpt shows the first four measures, labeled 5, 6, 7, and 8. The treble and bass staves are connected by dashed lines, indicating voice leading. The bass line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The treble line is labeled with figured bass notation: 6, 5, 6, 7, 5. The key signature is E major: V. The subject is indicated in measures 7 and 8.

a. Oster Collection (File 71/7 recto)

Handwritten musical score for "Sprayed with fixatif" by John Cage. The score is written on multiple staves and includes extensive handwritten annotations in various colors (pink, blue, green, orange, black). The annotations include notes, rests, and other musical symbols. The score is divided into sections labeled "subject mm. 13-15" and "episode mm. 9-13". The score is written in a complex, overlapping manner, with many notes and rests. The title "Sprayed with fixatif" is written vertically on the left side. The composer's name "John Cage" is written at the bottom left. The score is dated "No 20 b 8 linig." at the bottom left. The score is written on a piece of paper with a grid pattern. The score is written in a complex, overlapping manner, with many notes and rests. The score is written in a complex, overlapping manner, with many notes and rests. The score is written in a complex, overlapping manner, with many notes and rests.

Box highlights
sketch of
mm. 28–34

Sprayed with fixatif

Example 10. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (*WTC I*), modified and inverted subject entries, mm. 21–25

a. Middleground framework

d: V# I

b. Foreground framework

d: V# I

c. Score excerpt

d: V# I

Example 11. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), “rhyme” scheme, mm. 17–21

a. Middleground framework

in v: I ————— V ————— I

b. Foreground framework

c. Score excerpt

17 18 19 20 21

subject

subject

Example 12. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), “rhyme” scheme, mm. 39–43

a. Middleground framework

Diagram illustrating the middleground framework of the fugue, measures 39–43. The score shows the treble and bass staves with notes and accidentals. Above the staves, measures 39, 40, 41, 42, and 43 are labeled. A horizontal line with a brace connects measures 39 and 41, with a '3' above it. Another horizontal line with a brace connects measures 40 and 42, with a '2' above it. A third horizontal line with a brace connects measures 41 and 43, with a '1' above it. Below the staves, the key signature is indicated as 'dm:'. The harmonic structure is shown as a sequence of chords: I (measure 39), V (measure 41), and I (measure 43). The bass line is marked with a '4' and a '5'.

b. Foreground framework

Diagram illustrating the foreground framework of the fugue, measures 39–43. The score shows the treble and bass staves with notes and accidentals. Above the staves, measures 39, 40, 41, 42, and 43 are labeled. A horizontal line with a brace connects measures 39 and 41, with a '3' above it. Another horizontal line with a brace connects measures 40 and 42, with a '2' above it. A third horizontal line with a brace connects measures 41 and 43, with a '1' above it. Below the staves, the key signature is indicated as 'dm:'. The harmonic structure is shown as a sequence of chords: I (measure 39), V (measure 41), and I (measure 43). The bass line is marked with a '4' and a '5'.

c. Score excerpt

Diagram illustrating the score excerpt of the fugue, measures 39–43. The score shows the treble and bass staves with notes and accidentals. Above the staves, measures 39, 40, 41, 42, and 43 are labeled. A horizontal line with a brace connects measures 39 and 41, with a '3' above it. Another horizontal line with a brace connects measures 40 and 42, with a '2' above it. A third horizontal line with a brace connects measures 41 and 43, with a '1' above it. Below the staves, the key signature is indicated as 'dm:'. The harmonic structure is shown as a sequence of chords: I (measure 39), V (measure 41), and I (measure 43). The bass line is marked with a '4' and a '5'.

Example 13. Schenker's unpublished sketch of first episode, mm. 9–13, in J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I) from the Oster Collection (File 71/8 verso). High-resolution color images courtesy of the Music Division, The New York Public Library for the Performing Arts

subject

episode mm. 9-13

answer

subject

Paul. a. 1781

Protokoll-Schulz-Merke
Nr 20b
8 linig.

Sprayed with fixatif

Example 14. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (*WTC I*), contrapuntal framework for mm. 9–13

a. Middleground framework

b. Foreground framework

The first system of the musical score consists of five measures, numbered 9 through 13. The key signature is one flat (B-flat), and the time signature is 6/8. The melody is written in the treble clef, and the bass line is in the bass clef. Measure 9: Treble has a quarter note G4 and a quarter note A4; Bass has a half note G3. Measure 10: Treble has a quarter note Bb4 and a quarter note C5; Bass has a half note G3. Measure 11: Treble has a quarter note Bb4 and a quarter note C5; Bass has a half note G3. Measure 12: Treble has a quarter note Bb4 and a quarter note C5; Bass has a half note G3. Measure 13: Treble has a quarter note Bb4 and a quarter note C5; Bass has a half note G3.

c. Score excerpt

Measures 9-13 of the musical score for 'The Rose Tree'. The score is written for piano and voice. The piano part features a continuous eighth-note accompaniment in the left hand and chords in the right hand. The voice part enters in measure 9 with the lyrics 'The rose tree, the rose tree' and continues through measure 13.

Example 15. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), contrapuntal framework for mm. 15–17

a. Middleground framework

Diagram illustrating the middleground framework for measures 15–17. The notation shows three measures (15, 16, 17) with a treble and bass staff. Measure 15 features a treble staff with a half note G4 and a bass staff with a half note F4. Measure 16 features a treble staff with a half note A4 and a bass staff with a half note G4. Measure 17 features a treble staff with a half note B4 and a bass staff with a half note A4. A horizontal line labeled "dm: V#" spans the bottom of the measures, indicating a dominant seventh chord.

b. Foreground framework

Diagram illustrating the foreground framework for measures 15–17. The notation shows three measures (15, 16, 17) with a treble and bass staff. Measure 15 features a treble staff with a half note G4 and a bass staff with a half note F4. Measure 16 features a treble staff with a half note A4 and a bass staff with a half note G4. Measure 17 features a treble staff with a half note B4 and a bass staff with a half note A4. A horizontal line labeled "5 — 6" spans the bottom of the measures, indicating a fifth and sixth interval.

c. Score excerpt

Diagram illustrating the score excerpt for measures 15–17. The notation shows three measures (15, 16, 17) with a treble and bass staff. Measure 15 is labeled "A" and features a treble staff with a half note G4 and a bass staff with a half note F4. Measure 16 is labeled "Bb" and features a treble staff with a half note A4 and a bass staff with a half note G4. Measure 17 is labeled "C" and features a treble staff with a half note B4 and a bass staff with a half note A4. A horizontal line labeled "N" spans the bottom of the measures, indicating a note.

Example 16. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), contrapuntal framework for mm. 28–34

a. Middleground framework

dm: 12

This musical score shows the middleground framework for measures 28–34. It features a grand staff with treble and bass clefs. The key signature is D minor (two flats). The time signature is 12/8. The score includes measure numbers 28 through 34 in boxes above the staff. A dashed line connects the first note of measure 28 to the first note of measure 34, indicating a long-range contrapuntal relationship. The notation includes various note values, rests, and accidentals.

b. Foreground framework

This musical score shows the foreground framework for measures 28–34. It features a grand staff with treble and bass clefs. The key signature is D minor (two flats). The time signature is 12/8. The score includes measure numbers 28 through 34 in boxes above the staff. The notation includes various note values, rests, and accidentals. The foreground framework highlights specific melodic and harmonic elements within the measures.

c. Score excerpt

This musical score excerpt shows the original notation for measures 28–34. It features a grand staff with treble and bass clefs. The key signature is D minor (two flats). The time signature is 12/8. The score includes measure numbers 28 through 34 in boxes above the staff. The notation includes various note values, rests, and accidentals, providing a detailed view of the musical texture.

Example 17. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), voice-leading sketch

Example 18. J. S. Bach, Fugue in D minor (WTC I), possible locations for structural $\hat{4}$ - $\hat{3}$ descent, mm. 21–39

21 24 25

Fränck (2010)

$\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$

d: I V^8 — 7 I

26 28

Schenker ([1935]1979)

$\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$

IV V^7 I

31 33 34

Π^6 $\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$
 V_2^1 I^6

38 39

Väisälä (2011)

$\hat{4}$ $\hat{3}$

V^8 — 7 I^4 — 3 etc.