



MTO 26.3 Examples: Rodgers and Osborne, Prolongational Closure in the Lieder of Fanny Hensel

(Note: audio, video, and other interactive examples are only available online)
<https://mtosmt.org/issues/mto.20.26.3/mto.20.26.3.rodgersosborne.html>

Example 1. Hensel's Lieder that end with prolongational closure

Title	H-U	Date	Location of score	Type of prolongational closure	Specifics
An die Entfernte	105	1823	unpublished; available via request from the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin (MA Ms. 34, pp. 30ff.)	dominant substitution	vii ^{o4} -i (mm. 11-12)
Glück	125	1824		early pedal	V ⁷ over tonic ped.-I (mm. 33-34), followed by IAC in pno. alone
Der Eichwald brauset	170	1826	published by Breitkopf & Härtel (<i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 1)	early pedal	V ⁷ over tonic ped.-I (mm. 34-35)
Der Sprosser	180	1826	unpublished; available via request from the Staatsbibliothek zu Berlin (MA Ms. 35, pp. 59ff.)	early pedal	vii ^{o7} over tonic ped.-I (mm. 59-60)
Marias Klage	188	1826		dominant substitution or early pedal	vii ^{o7} -I (mm. 66-67) or vii ^{o7} over tonic ped.-I (=V ⁷ /IV) (mm. 72-73)
Kein Blick der Hoffnung	197	1827	published by Breitkopf & Härtel (<i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 1)	early pedal	vii ^{o7} over tonic ped.-I (mm. 16-17)
Über allen Gipfeln ist Ruh	285	1835	published by Breitkopf & Härtel (<i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 2)	dominant substitution	"ii ⁷ "-I (mm. 34-35)
Fichtenbaum und Palme	328	1838	published by Breitkopf & Härtel (<i>Ausgewählte Lieder</i> , vol. 2)	early pedal	vii ^{o7} over tonic ped.-I (m. 31)
Bitte	440	1846	published by Bote & Bock (<i>Sechs Lieder</i> , op. 7)	dominant substitution	vii ^{o4} -I (mm. 15-16)

Example 2. $\hat{5}$ - $\hat{1}$ -fill prolongational closure in Grieg, “Ase’s Death” (drawn from William Caplin’s forthcoming book *Cadence: A Study of Closure in Tonal Music*)

The image displays two systems of musical notation for piano, illustrating a $\hat{5}$ - $\hat{1}$ -fill prolongational closure in Grieg's "Ase's Death".

System 1 (Antecedent):

- Key signature: D major (two sharps).
- Time signature: Common time (C).
- Staff 1 (Treble clef): Contains a melodic line with a $\hat{5}$ - $\hat{1}$ -fill. The first measure is marked *p*. The phrase is labeled "antecedent" and "b.i." (beginning of antecedent). The second measure is marked "c.i." (continuation of antecedent). The phrase ends with a half note G4, which is the $\hat{1}$ of the scale. The final measure is marked "V" and "HC" (half cadence).
- Staff 2 (Bass clef): Contains a bass line. The first measure is marked *p*. The phrase is labeled "b: I..." (beginning of antecedent). The second measure is marked "etc." (etcetera). The phrase ends with a half note G2, which is the $\hat{1}$ of the scale.

System 2 (Consequent):

- Staff 1 (Treble clef): Contains a melodic line with a $\hat{5}$ - $\hat{1}$ -fill. The first measure is marked *pp*. The phrase is labeled "consequent ?" and "b.i." (beginning of consequent). The second measure is marked "c.i." (continuation of consequent). The phrase ends with a half note G4, which is the $\hat{1}$ of the scale. The final measure is marked "V" and "HC" (half cadence).
- Staff 2 (Bass clef): Contains a bass line. The first measure is marked *pp*. The phrase is labeled "b: I..." (beginning of consequent). The second measure is marked "etc." (etcetera). The phrase ends with a half note G2, which is the $\hat{1}$ of the scale.

Harmonic Analysis:

The harmonic analysis is provided below the staffs, corresponding to the measures of the music:

- Measure 1: II^7
- Measure 2: I^6
- Measure 3: IV^7
- Measure 4: V (marked with a circled 5)
- Measure 5: (IV^7) (marked with a circled 4)
- Measure 6: VII^6 (marked with a circled 3)
- Measure 7: I (marked with a circled 2)
- Measure 8: I (marked with a circled 1, labeled "(prolong. closure)")

Example 3. Grieg, "Ase's Death," with analytic overlay

consequent ? b.i. c.i.

5 10 16 etc.

pp

T PD D T

II⁷ I⁶ IV⁷ V (IV⁷) VII⁶ I (prolong. closure)

Example 4. Hensel, "Über allen Gipfeln ist Ruh," ending

29 auch, bal - de ru - hest du auch. _____

29 35 40

p

vi⁶ V₂/iv iv⁶ V₃/iv iv I⁶ I

Example 5. Dominant-substitution prolongational closure

Example 5 consists of two musical phrases, labeled 'a.' and 'b.', in 3/4 time, key of D major. Both phrases are written for piano with treble and bass staves. The notes are as follows:

- Phrase a:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (half).
- Phrase b:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (half).

The harmonic analysis below the staves is as follows:

- Phrase a:** I, ii⁶, V⁷, I
- Phrase b:** I, ii⁶, vii^{o4}₃, I

Example 6. Another realization of dominant-substitution prolongational closure

Example 6 consists of two musical phrases, labeled 'a.' and 'b.', in 4/4 time, key of D major. Both phrases are written for piano with treble and bass staves. The notes are as follows:

- Phrase a:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (quarter), A4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (quarter), A3 (half).
- Phrase b:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (quarter), A4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (quarter), A3 (half).

The harmonic analysis below the staves is as follows:

- Phrase a:** I, vi, IV, V⁷, I
- Phrase b:** I, vi, IV, V⁴₃, I

Example 7. Early-pedal prolongational closure

Example 7 consists of two musical phrases, labeled 'a.' and 'b.', in 3/4 time, key of D major. Both phrases are written for piano with treble and bass staves. The notes are as follows:

- Phrase a:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (half).
- Phrase b:** Treble: D4 (quarter), E4 (quarter), F#4 (quarter), G4 (half). Bass: D3 (quarter), E3 (quarter), F#3 (quarter), G3 (half).

The harmonic analysis below the staves is as follows:

- Phrase a:** I, IV⁶, V⁶₅, I, ii⁶, V⁷, I
- Phrase b:** I, IV⁶, V⁶₅, I_{ped.} (ii), (V⁷), I

Example 8. Hensel, "An die Entfernte," opening strophe recomposed

presentation

So hab' ich wirk - lich dich ver - lo - ren? Bist du, o

5 continuation

Schö - ne, mir ent - flohn? Noch klingt in den ge - wohn - ten Oh - ren ein je - des

9

Wort, — ein je - der Ton, — ein je - des Wort, — ein je - der Ton.

e: PAC

Example 9. Hensel, "An die Entfernte," opening strophe as written

presentation

So hab' ich wirk - lich dich ver - lo - ren? Bist du, o

e: VI

continuation

Schö - ne, mir ent - flohn? Noch klingt in den ge - wohn - ten Oh - ren ein je - des

a: VI

Wort, — ein je - der Ton, — ein je - des Wort, — ein je - der Ton.

e: VI i^6 N^6 vii°_3 i

e: prol. closure

Example 10. Hensel, "Der Sprosser," section A

antecedent

Was zieht mit leis' ver-klung'-nem Be-ben, was weht mit wel-chem Flö-ten-ton als wollt' es

consequent

auf zum Him - mel schwe - ben, als trü - gen En - gel es da - von? Das sind des

C: HC

Spros-sers Lie - bes - kla - gen, es ü - ber - strömt das klei-ne Herz; er hat nicht

Wor-te es zu sa-gen, in Tö - nen spricht sein tie-fer Schmerz.

i ped.

(iv)

(V⁷)

I

C: prol. closure

Example 11. Hensel, "Der Sprosser," section B

presentation

Ich ha - be, Ar - mer, dich ver - stan - den, dem Lieb - chengalt der Sehn-sucht

continuation

23 laut. Auch mei - ner zieht nach fer - nen Lan - den, doch

ii^6_5 $V^6_{5/V}$

dolce

26 hört — ihn kei - ne sü - ße Braut.

cad.⁶₄ V^7 I

C: PAC

Example 12. Hensel, "Der Sprosser," section B'

presentation

Du hast dein Lieb - chen nun ge - fun - den, sie hör - te, hol - der Sän - ger,

53 continuation

dich, ihr ju - belt bei - der nun ver - bun - den, und

53

$ii^{\circ 5}$ $vii^{\circ 5}/V$ V^6_5

56 *dolcissimo*

ich, ich wei - - - ne still für mich.

56

i ped. $(vii^{\circ 7})$ (i) $(vii^{\circ 7})$ I

C: prol. closure

Example 13. Hensel, "Fichtenbaum und Palme," section A

p

Ein Fich - ten - baum steht ein - sam im

p

Nor - den auf kah - ler Höh. Ihn schlä - fert; mit wei - ßer

IV c: VI cad.⁶ V i

Dek - ke um - hül - len ihn Eis und

Schnee, mit wei - ßer Dek - ke um - hül - len ihn Eis und Schnee.

E♭: vi⁶ V⁴/iv IV⁶ ⁵/₃ iv I iv I iv I

E♭: PC

Example 14. Hensel, "Fichtenbaum und Palme," section B

p Er

f *8va* *dim.*

B: I V

14 träumt von ei - ner Pal - me, die,

14 *p*

16 tonal pairing of I and iv begins

16 fern im Mor - gen - land,

B: V⁷/iv iv⁴ I

e: V⁷ i⁴ V

18 *sfz* *dim.* *p*

18 ein - sam und schwei - gend trau - ert auf

20 *sfz*

bren - nen - der Fel - sen - wand,

22 *cresc.*

ein - sam und schwei - gend - trau -

24

- - - ert auf bren - nen - der

B: V⁷
e: V⁷/V

V⁷/iv
V⁷

26

Fel - sen - wand. Er

iv⁶

vii⁴₃

I

i⁶

vii⁴₃/V

V

B: prol. closure

Example 15. Hensel, "Fichtenbaum und Palme," end of section B recomposed

ein - sam und schwei - gend trau - - - - -

25 ert auf bren - - - - - nen - der

25

27 Fel - - - - - sen - wand. Er

27

V^7/iv

iv^6 V^7 I

B: PAC

Example 16. Hensel, "Fichtenbaum und Palme," section C

immediate tonal pairing of I and iv

Er träumt von ei-ner Pal - me, die,

30 fern im Mor - gen - land, ein - sam und schweigend trau - ert auf

30 IV⁶ iv⁶ ⁵/₃ I_{ped.} *p* (vii^{o7}/iv) (iv)

32 bren - nen-der Fal - sen - wand, auf bren - nen-der Fel - sen - wand. 8va - - -

32 (vii^{o7}) I

E_b : prol. closure

Example 17. Hensel, "Fichtenbaum und Palme," end of section C recomposed

Er träumt von ei-ner Pal - me, die,

30 fern im Mor - gen - land, ein - sam und schweigend trau - ert auf

30 $Eb: I$ $vii^{\circ 7}/iv$ iv

32 *p* bren - nen-der Fel - sen - wand, auf bren - nen-der Fel - sen - wand. *8va*

32 V_7^{b9-8} I

$Eb: PAC$

Example 18. Hensel, "Marias Klage," section A

antecedent

Fließt, o Thrä - nen, netzt den Schlei - er, fließt aufs Braut-ge-schenk hin -

g: i

consequent

ab, das beim Ab - schied jüngst mein Treu - er mir mit

vii^{o7} (no cadence)

kuß und Thrä - nen gab! Wie - der - kehr__ und Hoch-zeits -

V⁷ i Bb: IV

g: IAC

fei - er, Jüng-ling, schwand mit dir__ ins__ Grab.

V⁷ I

Bb: PAC

Example 19. Hensel, "Marias Klage," section B

poco più mosso

Nein, ver-senkt im wüs - ten Mee - re, wogt dein Lieb um

Klipp' und Bank, un - be-stat-tet, oh - ne Zäh - re, oh - ne Lied und

Glo - cken - klang; trau - rig - dir - zur letz - ten Eh - re -

scholl des Meers und Sturms Ge - sang.

g: V

vii⁶₅ i⁶

V g: HC tonicizes B $\flat$

vii⁶₅/iv iv⁶ vii⁴₃/V

28

Jetzt am fer - nen Stran - de kla - get dich dein ar - mes

32

Mäd - chen hier; wann es nach - tet, wann es ta - get, nim - mer ruht der

vii⁶₅ i⁶

36

Jam - mer mir; kein Ge - dank'und Wunsch be - ha - get, als ver - eint, ve -

V g: HC vii⁶₅/iv iv⁶

40

reint zu _ sein mit dir. _____

singer stops short

iv⁶ V⁹/V

Example 20. Hensel, "Marias Klage," section C

Man - che Nacht - er - schei - nung deu - tet,

una corda *pp*

B $\flat$: I 6 4

62 sel - ber bald werd' ich ver - blühn: dump - fer Hall von

62

End of 8-measure phrase and the stanza's fourth line

65 Glo - cken läu - tet, Bahr' und Lei - chen - fol - ger ziehn. Komm, o

65

iv₄ vii^o₇ I ped.

68 Tod, der hin mich lei - tet, Ihn zu schaun, — B $\flat$: prol. closure?

68

71
Ihn zu schau_n auf e - - - wig Ihn!

(V⁷/IV) (IV) (V⁷) I = V⁷/IV

B $\flat$: prol. closure?

74

Example 21. Robert Schumann's late Lieder that end with prolongational closure

Title	Opus	Date	Type of prolongational closure	Specifics
Der Contrabandiste	74/10	1849	early pedal	V ⁹ -I over tonic pedal (mm. 94-95)
Mein Garten	77/2	1849	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯4} -I (mm. 32-33)
Wiegenlied	78/3	1849	early pedal	V ¹³ -I over tonic pedal (mm. 63-64)
Weihnachtslied	79/16	1849	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯4} -I (mm. 29-30)
Des Sennen Abschied	79/22	1849	early pedal	V ¹³ -I over tonic pedal (mm. 57-58)
Die Blume der Ergebung	83/3	1850	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯4} -I (mm. 48-349)
Es stürmet am Abendhimmel	89/1	1850	dominant substitution	ii ^{♯6} -i (mm. 32-33)
Abschied vom Walde	89/4	1850	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯4} -I (mm. 26-27)
Kommen und Scheiden	90/3	1850	♯-1-fill	vii ^{♯4} -I (mm. 15-16)
Der schwere Abend	90/6	1850	dominant substitution	V ⁹ -I (mm. 30-31)
Wer nie sein Brot mit Tränen ass	98a/4	1849	early pedal	V ⁷ -i over tonic pedal (mm. 31-32)
Heiss mich nicht reden	98a/5	1849	dominant substitution	Fr ⁺⁶ /I-I (mm. 59-60)
Die Fensterscheibe	107/2	1851	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯4} -i (mm. 44-45)
Romanze, Ebro caudolse	138/5	1849	dominant substitution	vii ^{♯7} -i (mm. 44-45)