

Appendix 1

Alfred Lorenz's Analysis of the Annunciation of Death Scene from *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Richard Wagner*:

Translation, Reconstruction, and Commentary

Lorenz presents an analysis of the Annunciation of Death scene in *Das Geheimnis der Form bei Richard Wagner Vol. 1: Der Musikalische Aufbau des Bühnenfestspiels Der Ring des Nibelungen* (1924, 179–84; my translation of his analysis is seen below). He reads the scene as a “potentiated bar form” (potenzierte Barform= Über-Stollen, Über-Stollen, Über-Abgesang), with each section subdivided into smaller bar form.³⁵ His sectional division is strictly based on leitmotivic identification and organizational relationships such as symmetry and repetition.³⁶

Lorenz argues that bar form contains inherent dramatic momentum, projecting dynamic growth through its intrinsic directionality. He emphasized that the Abgesang is an intensification over the Stollen through organic growth. The Abgesang consummates this organic development from the smallest structural unit to the large-scale formal organization: “Bar form is known to be divided into two Stollen and one Abgesang. If we reflect this form in the smallest dimension, the name is also applicable to thematic structure. Indeed, this application is justified, as the essence of bar form lies in the seeds which the Stollen make blossom in the Abgesang, and it can and must manifest even in the smallest parts. After its repetition, this spinning-out of a musical idea to a vigorous prolongation is, practically speaking, a musical archetypal phenomenon; the musical procreation of a creator is seen directly in the formation of such a viable smallest-possible Abgesang” (1924, 103; translation is mine).

Nevertheless, what he specifically means by “intensification” remains somewhat obscure. As he does not exactly explain its mechanism through specific musical analysis, it is unclear how intensification evolves from the Stollen to Abgesang. Within a single bar form unit, two Stollen typically exhibit motivic similarity through shared leitmotifs; by contrast, the distinction between the Stollen and Abgesang can be best described as the use of different leitmotifs, absent implications of dynamic increase, motivic development, or unit enlargement.

Throughout Lorenz's analysis, the most conspicuous feature is the nesting of bar and arch form on multiple levels in step with the bar form's ascendance. The tidy replication of the same or similar form, from the largest to the smallest unit, indeed permeates the analysis. This formalist assessment, however, also bears consideration in terms of the Zeitgeist of Nazi Germany. McClatchie outlines a correlation between Lorenz's theory and National Socialist ideology:

Regionally, the NSDAP (and hence Germany as a whole after 1933) was organized into interlocking units or administrative districts, each with their respective leaders: a region (*Gau*) contained several districts (*Kreise*) that were made up of local groups (*Ortsgruppen*) comprised of cells (*Zellen*) formed by blocks (*Blöcke*). Analytically, Lorenz argues for the organic growth of Wagner's works from the seeds of Lorenz's formal types. He finds these formal patterning interpenetrated across all levels of Wagner's work: a small Bar form may also be the first Stollen of a larger Bar, which is also part of a still larger structure, and so on, up to the level of the act, and finally of the opera as a whole (McClatchie 1998, 210).³⁷

Consequently, Lorenz's seemingly formalistic reading of the scene can be understood in part as a reflection of the social structure of his time.

Part I. Great-Stollen 1 (Über-Stollen 1, 152/4–159/1/1)

| Great bar form | Middle bar forms | Small bar forms | Motives |
|--|----------------------------|--|--|
| Stollen (152/4/1–153/3/5); 29 mm. | Stollen (152/4/1–152/5/6) | Stollen (152/4/1–152/4/4; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Stollen (152/4/5–152/5/2; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (152/5/3–152/5/6, 4 mm.) | Death-Song ³⁸ |
| | Stollen (153/1/1–153/2/6) | Stollen (153/1/1–153/1/4; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Stollen (153/1/5–153/2/2; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (153/2/3–153/2/6; 4 mm.) | Death-Song |
| | Abgesang (153/3/1–153/3/5) | Stollen (153/3/1; 1 m.) | Sword-Fourth, ³⁹ and Valhalla |
| | | Stollen (153/3/2; 1 m.) | Sword-Fourth, and Valhalla |
| | | Abgesang (153/3/3–153/3/5; 3 mm.) | Valhalla (concluding part of the theme) |
| Stollen (153/4/1–154/4/4); 26 mm. | Stollen (153/4/1–154/1/6) | Stollen (153/4/1–153/4/4; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Stollen (153/4/5–154/1/2; 4 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (154/1/3–154/1/6; 4 mm.) | Death-Song |
| | Stollen (154/2/1–154/3/3) | Stollen (154/2/1–154/2/3; 3 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Stollen (154/2/4–154/3/1; 3 mm.) | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (154/3/2–154/3/3; 2 mm.) | Sword-Fourth, and Valhalla |
| | Abgesang (154/3/4–154/4/4) | Stollen (154/3/4; 1 m.) | Sword-Fourth, and Valhalla |
| | | Stollen (154/3/5; 1 m.) | Sword-Fourth, and Valhalla |
| | | Abgesang (154/4/1–154/4/4; 4 mm.) | Valhalla (the concluding and coda part) |
| Pre-Abgesang (154/4/5–155/2/3); 14 mm. | | | |
| Abgesang (155/2/4–159/1/1); 97 mm. | Stollen (155/2/4–156/2/4) | Stollen 1 (155/2/4–155/4/4; 4+3+5 mm.) | Death-Song +Valhalla+Valhalla's main part |
| | | Stollen 2 (155/4/5–156/2/4; 4+2+4 mm.) | Death-Song+Valhalla+Walküre |
| | Stollen (156/3/1–157/3/4) | Stollen 1 (156/3/1–156/4/2; 4+4 mm.) | Death-Song+Valhalla's main part |
| | | Stollen 2 (156/4/3–157/3/4; 4+12 mm.) | Death-Song+Walküre, Freia, and Valhalla (at the end) ⁴⁰ |
| | Abgesang (157/3/5–159/1/1) | 157/3/5–157/5/4; 10 mm. | Chord progression |
| | | 157/5/5–158/1/2; 4 mm. | Death-Song |

| | | |
|--|------------------------|---|
| | 158/1/3–158/1/6; 4 mm. | Death-Song; deceptive cadence ⁴¹ |
| | 158/2/1–158/3/2; 7 mm. | Cadence in E \flat minor |
| | 158/3/3–158/4/1; 5 mm. | Love |
| | 158/4/2–158/5/1; 6 mm. | Valhalla |
| | 158/5/2–158/5/5; 4 mm. | Freia |
| | 159/1/1; 1 m. | Half cadence in D \flat major |

Part II. Great-Stollen 2 (Über-Stollen 2, 159/1/2–164/4/1)

| Great bar form | Middle forms | Small forms | Motives |
|---------------------------------------|---|---|---|
| Stollen (159/1/2–160/2/1); 17 mm. | Bar form (159/1/2–159/3/2) | Stollen (159/1/2–159/1/3); 2 mm. | Fate |
| | | Stollen (159/1/4–159/2/1); 3 mm. | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (159/2/2–159/3/2); 5 mm. | Death-Song |
| | Arch form (159/3/3–160/2/1) ⁴² | Main section (159/3/3); 1 m. | Fate |
| | | Middle section (159/4/1–160/1/1); 4 mm. | Love, and Renunciation |
| | | Reprise (160/1/2–160/1/3; 2 mm.) | Fate, then full cadence in C \sharp minor in 160/2/1 ⁴³ |
| Stollen (160/2/2–161/3/2); 21 mm. | Bar form (160/2/2–160/4/3) | Stollen (160/2/2–160/2/3); 2 mm. | Fate |
| | | Stollen (160/2/4–160/2/5); 2 mm. | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (160/3/1–160/4/1); 5 mm. | Death-Song |
| | | Cadence in 160/4/2–160/4/3; 2 mm. | n/a |
| | Bar form (160/4/4–161/3/2) | Stollen (160/4/4–161/1/1); 3mm. | Fate |
| | | Abgesang (161/2/1–161/3/2); 5 mm. | Chord progression; full cadence in A major ⁴⁴ |
| Abgesang (161/3/3–164/2/6); 59 mm. | Arch form (161/3/3–164/2/6) | Main section (161/3/3–162/3/4); 4+2+4+4+2 mm. | 4 mm.: Fate (stated twice) 2 mm.: fill 4 mm.: Stark motive (=Sword) 4 mm.: violent triplets 2 mm.: fill |
| | | Middle section (162/4/1–163/4/4); 21 mm.; low point | 21 mm.: Flight-spinning out ⁴⁵ |
| | | Main section (163/5/1–164/2/6); 2+4+4+2+4 mm. | 2 mm.: fill 4 mm.: violent triplets |

| | | |
|--|-------------------------------|--|
| | | 4 mm.: Stark motive (Flight motive in the bass progression) 2 mm.: fill 4 mm.: Fate (stated twice) |
| | Coda (164/3/1–164/4/1; 6 mm.) | Renunciation, ending with a half cadence in F# |

Part III. Great-Abgesang (Über-Abgesang, 164/4/2–172/4)

| Great bar form | Middle and small forms | | Motives |
|--|---|--|---|
| Stollen (164/4/2–166/2/1); 20 mm. | Stollen (164/4/2–165/2/1); 3+4 mm. | | Flight-Attack+Death-Song (Variant 1) ⁴⁶ |
| | Stollen (165/2/2–165/4/3); 2+2+4 mm. | | Flight-Attack (stated twice)+Death-Song (Variant 1) |
| | Abgesang (166/1/1–166/2/1); 2+2+1 mm. | | Ill Fortune Chord ⁴⁷ +chord progression+cadence in E |
| Stollen (166/2/2–167/4/3); 25 mm. | Stollen (166/2/2–166/3/4); 3+4 mm. | | Flight-Attack+Death-Song (Variant 1) |
| | Interpolation (166/4/1–167/1/1); 5mm. | | |
| | Stollen (167/1/2–167/2/4); 2+2+3 mm. | | Flight-Attack |
| | Abgesang (167/3/1–167/4/3); 2+2+2 mm. | | Glance+Love+Renunciation (half cadence in A) ^{48 49} |
| Abgesang I (167/4/4–168/4/2); 16 mm. | Main section (167/4/4–168/2/3); 8 mm. | Introduction (167/4/4); 1 m. | n/a |
| | | Stollen (168/1/1–168/1/3.2); 2½ mm. | Sword-Blow (Schwerthieb; trombone) with melody from Death-Song |
| | | Stollen (168/1/3.3–168/2/1); 2½ mm. | Sword-Blow with melody from Death-Song |
| | | Abgesang (168/2/2–168/2/3); 2 mm. | <i>Sforzato</i> chords |
| | Middle section (168/2/4–168/3/1); 2 mm. | | Sword-Guardian (Schwertwart) |
| | Main section (168/3/2–168/4/2); 6 mm. | Stollen (168/3/2–168/3/3); 2 mm. | Loge's Sixth with Trills |
| | | Stollen (168/3/4–168/3/5); 2 mm. | Loge's Sixth with Trills (half step higher) |
| Abgesang (168/4/1–168/4/2); 2 mm. | | Incomplete half cadence in C ⁵⁰ | |
| Abgesang II (168/4/3–172/4/2) 71 mm. | Main section (168/4/3–170/2/1; 23 mm.); 3+5+2+2+3+2+1+5 mm.; F# to A | | 3 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) ⁵¹ 5 mm.: Glance with descending leap 2 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 2 mm.: full cadence in F# ⁵² 3 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 2 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 1 m.: Flight |

| | | |
|--|--|--|
| | | 5 mm.: ends on a half cadence in A ⁵³ |
| | Middle section (170/2/2–171/1/3; 18 mm.); 4+8+4+2 mm.; C to A | 4 mm.: Chase 8 mm.: chord progression; cadence in C 4 mm.: Chase 2 mm.: cadence in A |
| | Main section (171/1/4–172/4/2; 30 mm.); 3+4+2+2+2+4+4+4+3+2 mm.; ends with V/A | 3 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 4 mm.: Glance with descending leap 2 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 2 mm.: Flight 2 mm.: Death-Song (Variant 2) 4 mm.: Glance 4 mm.: Flight 4 mm.: Glance 3 mm.: Flight 2 mm.: Death-Song, ending with a half cadence in A |

³⁵ For McClatchie’s discussion on Lorenz’s analysis of the scene, see his book 1998, 139–141. For a comparison of bar form and sentence structure in Wagner’s operas, see Matthew BaileyShea 2002, 1–18. Lorenz defines the potentiated bar form as a nesting of the bar form in multiple levels. McClatchie expounds on Lorenz’s construction: “when a single form occupies a period of considerable expanse, it is necessary that its parts be rationally ordered as well, so that the feeling not become shapeless [...] If these parts are themselves arranged according to the same formal type as that of the whole, Lorenz refers to this as a potentiation of form.” See McClatchie 1998, 135. However, in Lorenz’s analysis of the scene, as shown in the diagram, arch forms are also contained in the level of the middle and small bar forms.

³⁶ Although Lorenz’s analysis is usually considered an epitome of the formalistic approach in Wagner analysis, and his analytical method reflects the German idealism represented by Kant, Schopenhauer, and Nietzsche, McClatchie also sees it as “an embodiment of National Socialist ideology.” See McClatchie 1998, 25.

³⁷ In the quotation, NSDAP (Nationalsozialistische Deutsche Arbeiterpartei) means National Socialist German Workers’ Party. For Lorenz’s tie to the Party, see McClatchie 1998, 15–25 and 197–212.

³⁸ Lorenz calls the Question motive the “Death-Song” (Sterbegesang).

³⁹ The sword-fourth indicates the ascending fourth in the bass (A \flat to D \flat).

⁴⁰ Lorenz’s “Freia” designation is what I consider the *x* part of the Freia motive.

⁴¹ In this context, “deceptive cadence” means the Death-Song motive ending on V7/Em does not resolve to the expected tonic triad of E minor; here, it veers to the cadential 6/4 in D \sharp minor, enharmonically equivalent to E \flat minor.

⁴² The present paper translates HS (Hauptsatz) as “main section,” MS (Mittelsatz) as “middle section,” and RP (Reprise) as “reprise.”

⁴³ Although Lorenz calls this a “Vollkadenz,” it is an evaded cadence.

⁴⁴ Evaded cadence.

⁴⁵ Lorenz’s Flight motive is what I consider the *y* part of the Freia motive.

⁴⁶ Lorenz’s Variant 1 is Variant 1 in my analysis.

⁴⁷ The “Ill-Fortune Chord” motive (Mißwendeakkord) is a half-diminished seventh chord, which first appears in Siegmund’s line from Act 1, Scene 1, 14/1/4–14/2/5, “Ill-fortune follows wherever I flee; ill-fortune draws near me wherever I turn (Mißwende folgt mir wohin ich fliehe; Mißwende naht mir wo ich mich neige).”

⁴⁸ The Glance motive is taken from Wagner’s *Tristan und Isolde*.

⁴⁹ Lorenz’s original indication is “Kadenz in A.”

⁵⁰ Cadential 6/4 chord in C minor.

⁵¹ Lorenz’s Variant 2 is Variant 4 in my analysis.

⁵² Lorenz indicated this two-measure passage as “Vollkadenz in F#,” but it ends on a half cadence in the key, without subsequent tonic arrival.

⁵³ Lorenz’s original designation is “Kadenzierung nach A,” which implies motion and momentum. This can be more accurately translated as “cadencing in A.”